

Orchestra Demographic Trends: 2014-2023

June 16, 2023

CAEN THOMASON-REDUS: It's really an honor to have you here to talk about this important topic, and to get into this research that means a lot for the future of our field as it defines a lot about the current state of the field. And I appreciate you all being here, because this is something that takes a lot of us to address. So for this morning, we're going to have a couple of sections. We're going to start with the co-authors, and then we'll go to a panel to respond. And there will be time for some interactive Q&A, so please if you do have questions hold them towards the end, and I'll make sure that I look around and include them as possible.

So to begin, my name is Caen Thomason-Redus, I'm vice president of inclusion and learning here at the League of American Orchestras, and we have here with us our guests, co-authors, Evan Lynette [?], and Dr. Antonio Kyler. Please welcome them.

[APPLAUSE]

CAEN: And they're going to begin taking us through an overview of the report, and then afterwards we'll bring up our panel for some interactive dialogue.

ANTONIO KYLER: Thank you so much, Caen. Good morning everyone, we're really excited to share with you the results of the study, and to continue the conversation around what we were able to find. So we want to start by providing some context. The purpose of this report was, or is, to convey to the state of the field progress that has been made among racial, ethnic, and gender diversity, to measure future progress. So this will be a great benchmarking tool to assess your orchestra's performance when it comes to racial, ethnic, and gender diversity.

[0:02:00.6]

And to support the field in accelerating the change. There were two research questions that we used to kind of guide our inquiry. Number one, to what extent have orchestras made racial and ethnic progress since the last report in 2016, and to what extent have orchestras made progress regarding gender since the last report in 2016.

So the scope of the report is a snapshot and trend analyses for key orchestral roles including musicians, conductors, and music directors, staff, and top executives and board members. And so if you think about it as all of the professional positionalities of people, right? We're looking at the ways in which people can come through the door to participate in orchestras. And to contextualize the findings, it is demographics are only one measure of EDI progress, right? This is the representation piece.

Equity and inclusion, though this report gives some indication of what's happening there, we only really focus on the diversity piece of the EDI. And roles that are made in programming and organizational culture, the use of this report also will give some indication of that. But we want to keep in mind that every orchestras has its own unique story within this narrative to tell about what's happening relative to racial, ethnic, and gender diversity.

So who contributes to the report? First, member orchestras. We want to thank the 180 orchestras that provided their data that went into the report. And we want to encourage you to continue doing that, because we need your support and your help in continuing to do this work. Myself and my colleague, Evan Lynette, we partnered on this with Carrie Mayer [?] at the League as well as James McCain.

And then we also did something different this time where we had an advisory group of people who were representative of the orchestral field with different social identities to make sure that we were managing the data in a way that's equitable, representative, and acknowledging of the different positionalities. And also we had some participation and feedback from the League board, and also some public advocacy on the role.

[0:04:26.4]

EVAN LYNETTE: So much like in the 2016 report, we focus on a descriptive analysis. So these results are not necessarily predictive of the future of the field or providing recommendations. That's the conversation that we're starting today, and it'll start again every day in the orchestra field. One new addition into this report is a focus on data equity. So all racial, ethnic, and gender groups are represented and their stories are told, even in instance of a low sample size. We'll note that in the report, but we want to make sure that every story is told in this report.

And lastly, we want to ensure representativeness of this data. So with 180 participating orchestras, that give us about a 30% response rate from the League's 600 member orchestras. Looking at that in terms of a confidence level, that does give us about the recommended sample size we would need for a 95% confidence interval. And then we also verify this data with a constant sample of orchestras that responded year over year over this period, about 55 orchestras fit into this field.

520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036
americanorchestras.org

And then lastly, we have some confidence that about 50% of orchestras self-reported their data, which is a practice that the field is moving to. So from relatively starting points in 2013, we did see some signs of relative progress amongst certain groups in positionalities. These specific positions include Asian or Asian American conductors, women conductors, Black or African American staff or board members, Hispanic top executives, multiracial top executives, and women top executives, particularly in larger orchestras.

[0:06:10.0]

Putting this context into some perspective though, it's clear that certain historically and continuously marginalized groups are clearly less well represented than in the US population as a whole. We included US population census data in our benchmarking to give some amount of context to these results throughout the report, and we can see that in particular the proportion of Black and African American, Hispanic and Latino, and American Indian, and Alaskan Native people remains lower in every orchestral role than in their counts in the US census population. And that's also true for the proportion of women and nonbinary people, although for nonbinary people we don't have census data, but we do have a nationally represented sample that was in 2021.

ANTONIO: We also conducted a budgetary analysis to kind of measure progress between small and mid-size budgeted orchestras versus the larger budgeted orchestras, and we found that women's representation in all orchestra roles is focused within smaller to medium budget orchestras as to its representation of Black or African American, Hispanic, Latino, and multiracial musicians. In some areas, there have been little or no progress that orchestras have made since 2013 or earlier.

So for one, Black or African American musician representation has improved only marginally since 2010 when we started collecting this demographic data. Black or African American and multiracial music director representation each decreased between 2013 and 2023. The proportion of women music directors in larger budget orchestras also decreased during this decade. In addition, the growth of Asian and Asian American representation on staff halted during the pandemic years as the representation of other BIPOC groups increased.

EVAN: So we know that it can be hard to quantify and qualify EDI progress. Representation is just one measure of EDI progress. But we do see some strong representation among certain groups compared to the US population. So in these groups their counts in the most recent data is on the as strong or stronger than in the national averages.

So that's true for Asian or Asian American people in all artistic roles, multiracial people in artistic and top executive roles, Hawaiian and Pacific Islander people in all roles except for top executives, and women staff members. And we'll encourage you all to turn to page 27 in our report where we look at a demographic analysis. It's basically a breakdown of each of the racial ethnic groups. So it's a different look at the data. Instead of looking at it by positionality, you can also see by demographic group.

ANTONIO: So our final slide before we open it up to you all for questions are recommendations that are based on the data, all right? Like we tried to make sure to not overreach, because we wanted to give recommendations based on what the data tells us. And so first we need to address the low representation in the following areas. Black or African American, Latinx, or Hispanic, and American Indian, and Alaskan Native people in all artistic roles, particularly within larger budget orchestras.

Women in conductor and music director roles, particularly within larger budget orchestras. People of color in top executives and governance roles, nonbinary people in conductor, music director, top executive, and governance roles. We need to progress women's representation in top executive roles, particularly in larger budget orchestras. And then finally, we need to accelerate recent progress towards improved BIPOC representation on orchestra staff. And with that, we will open it up for discussion, or questions really quickly methodologically, and then we'll shift to the panel.

[0:10:24.9]

EVAN: Please Jack, go ahead.

[OFF-MIC QUESTION]

JACK: African Americans and Latinos basically representing 13% of the US population. In your report here, you didn't give us any numbers whatsoever, but what I've seen so far is that I think your language was marginally something. Are you feeling uncomfortable about giving us specific statistical numbers?

ANTONIO: No, the statistics are in the report. We chose for this particular presentation to try not to — to take the numbers out of it so as to focus on the text, and actually how we move forward. But the statistics and all of the numbers are actually in the report. Including what you just said about like the US census data. So we have the US census data as a sort of benchmark that we can compare to what's actually happening in orchestras.

JACK: Okay, just one quick follow up then. What does your language then, marginally — I forget what it actually — what your language said. I should have written it down. What does that mean, please?

EVAN: Yeah, so we use language relative, meaningful, significant to describe different levels. So because this isn't any inferential data, it's descriptive, we just look at percentage changes to determine what a meaningful change could be. For instance, if a population has a proportion of two percent, and that increases to three percent, that notes a different relative change than if a population goes from 30% to 31%. So that's where some of that language comes from. Relative progress, static progress, or meaningful progress.

[0:12:31.4]

JACK: And to describe that word, which is in the report, which you all can look at, it's basically emphasizing that there was a very small amount of change. That's what that word is saying?

EVAN: Yeah. In the back.

BETSY: Hi, thank you. I'm Betsy Pervis [?], I'm with the D.C. Youth Orchestra program. And my understanding is that youth orchestras are not represented in this report due to low response rates from us, is that — that's correct? I guess this is a question for the League. I guess this is a question for the League then, and I recognize a project — this is a huge project. Is it possible to do a parallel or supporting survey or project with the youth orchestras? I understand it takes a different kind of — we take a different kind of hand holding, but we are also the pipeline for all of these professions, and I think it's crucial that we be educated about how important it is that we participate in this kind of work.

EVAN: Thank you for the question. Yes, youth orchestra division is incredibly important. Carrie and Eric [?] can speak to the participation.

CARRIE: Yeah, so youth orchestras are represented in the report apart from musician roles actually. There was a relatively low response rate from youth orchestras. We'd love to increase that. I'll be easier from next year onwards, because we now have a standalone demographic survey. So previously this data was collected through the orchestra statistical report, and the salary and benefits survey. Now we have the standalone survey, and it's much easier for everyone to participate. And of course we'll be in contact with the YOD offices. Thank you for the question.

[0:14:13.1]

EVAN: And just quickly to follow up on the response rate. Out of the 180 orchestras, we had 156 adult orchestras, and 24 youth orchestras that participated.

LAUREN GREEN: Hi, my name is Lauren Green. I'm a fellow with the Seattle Symphony. I wanted to ask in terms of your preparation to help address this issue, the issues of the like lack of diversity within our field, how are you going to use your partnerships with like organizations such as Sphinx to help accelerated this change if you have already thought about that?

EVAN: So this is a question for the League in terms of our partnerships for moving forward?

LAUREN: Yes.

SPEAKER: Yes, we want all partnerships to be to the point. There's — very specifically we're doing inclusive stages, which is specifically to address the racial diversity of musicians on stage. So that's our immediate project, and focus and partnership. As far as working with Sphinx, as one example, we work together in many different ways, and we're actually increasing that. But Sphinx orchestral partners audition, the National Alliance for Audition Support, those are a couple of areas where we already overlap.

But yeah, in general, we're looking to increase partnership across all of the sectors that are reflected in this report. In terms of youth even, you know, working with some of the organizations that are out there, working with higher education, working definitely extensively with our own youth orchestra division. Working with other nonprofits such as Equity Arc, [UNINTEL] USA.

[0:15:56.9]

So partnership is absolutely our lifeblood as the League. And we're always open to suggestions as well.

ANTONIO: I also wanted to add that the League has already begun supporting orchestras in this work through the Promising Practices, and actually linked to the report actually is like a — really it's kind of like a curated slate of possibilities to get folks going towards actually helping with the recommendations.

CAEN: For any other questions, during this entire session of course everything is fair game. For this moment, while we have the authors here, if there are any clarifying questions about the report itself, the collection of the data, anything, that will be best suited for our guests currently. And then we'll get into more issues as we bring up the rest of the panel. Go ahead.

ANDRE: Hi, Andre with Sings Organization [?]. First of all, thank you for collecting the data. It's very eye opening. My question for you is, if you could talk about the data collection in terms of people self-identifying, or if it came from the administration staff in the initial stages, and in this current stage, how they differed or were similar.

CAEN: And when you say stages, are you talking about different reports? This report versus earlier [UNINTEL; OVERTALK] —

ANDRE: Yes, [UNINTEL] comparison data from —

CAEN: Right, so — go ahead, sorry.

EVAN: Yeah, so the League is moving towards self-reported data collection, that's a best practice in the field. But the field is — we're not quite there yet. In the 2016 report, nearly all the data was reported by a representative of each orchestra. So typically the finance or HR director. In this report, just under half of orchestras had self-reported data, which gives us a bit more confidence that we're able to say that someone identifies. So say women identifying as opposed to women identified. That's progress is being made in the field and it'll give us more confidence moving forward. But we're not quite there yet with 100% self-reported data, which gives us some amount of room to grow I guess.

[0:17:59.5]

ANTONIO: But with that, I do have a question back to you all. Do you think that self-reporting would increase the response rate of the data collected versus having someone else who is kind of like it's their professional role to go in and report that data? So like if you all received a survey from the League saying, "Please report on your demographic data," how likely are you to complete that survey?

[OFF-MIC QUESTION]

SPEAKER: Thank you. Because among other things, I have a a loud voice, so forgive me. In today's environment, there is a desire I believe for most organizations, particularly within our own field, to say what a great job we're doing with regard to EDI. And so we have a tendency to want to count even the pennies, much less the dollars, as in some way demonstrating that we're doing a wonderful job in EDI.

I for myself am not convinced that we are as an industry doing the job that we need to do. We still — I'm trying to wait, Caen, until the panel speaks. But we really still fall far behind most other American industries with regard to how we are doing with respect to EDI. You can just go to just about any other industry and the numbers, the statistics are much better than they are in the American orchestra industry. I tend to think that we are perhaps at the — I hate to say it, my dear friends, but at almost the bottom as compared to most other American industries with regard to how we are doing with EDI.

[0:19:55.3]

And because we are not doing as well as we can, or as well as we should perhaps I should say, we tend to want to use every possible idea about what a person might identify as and count that in as our EDI progress. And I'm just not sure that it's real.

ANTONIO: Well, and I think that if this data is reported by someone else at the orchestra versus being self-reported, I think it speaks to the voracity of the data, because the story is — it actually reflects what you just said, that the progress isn't being made in the ways in which we would like to see it being made. And so you know, trying to figure out if having people self-report or having someone at the orchestra report on people's demographics is a challenge, and I think it's an opportunity to figure out which one would get the best response rate.

SPEAKER: So speaking to what you just mentioned, is there any plan for the League to do some sort of comparative report with other creative fields, like theater, opera, anything like that?

ANTONIO: Yeah, in this report, we actually do some of that comparative analysis. Museums seem to be doing — and I'm trying to hold off as well, Caen, because there are some things that museums have that make it advantageous for them that we don't have in the orchestral world, but we do — because Opera America did a similar report last year. But the American Alliance of Museums has been a little bit better about reporting and consistently reporting their data. So that analysis is written into the report.

SPEAKER: Thank you.

EVAN: Yeah, and I'll add as well that some data from the board source conducted a study of the nonprofit sector as a whole, which is doing slightly better overall in terms of representation. But it's really interesting data to just compare to the nonprofit sector too for leadership roles.

[0:22:01.6]

CAEN: We'll do two more questions and then we'll switch to the rest of the panel.

ALAN BROWN: Good morning. Thank you so much for this excellent work. I'm Alan Brown, fellow Michigander. I look forward to seeing you, meeting you. I just look at this through the lens of equity, you know? And like where do the real power structures sit in our sector. And the power dynamics of basically what is historically a white western cultural tradition. And I just would like to advocate — so artistic decision makers, and — would just encourage some reflection on where diversity — how diversity is figuring into the levers of artistic — of programming. And obviously the board level. So I just — my question is really, what might be done, how could we advocate for including board representation in this study moving forward?

ANTONIO: We do look at the board —

ALAN: Sorry, am I missing —

ANTONIO: Yeah, the board is represented.

ALAN: They have reported on — oh okay, so then when you say governance roles, that's what —

ANTONIO: Yeah, like because the governance roles do not reflect the same — there is no parity, racial parity with the US population, and the board population of orchestras. So we do cover boards in this report.

ALAN: My mistake, thank you. Okay, and comparison with board and staff and orchestra. Yeah, fantastic.

[0:23:55.4]

ANTONIO: So we look at musicians, conductors and music directors, top executives, staff, and the board.

ALAN: Yeah, fantastic.

ANTONIO: What is missing though are like volunteers and partners, right? Because again, I use this analogy of if you want to get more people who are different in the door, all of these different positionalities in which people can come into an orchestra, like how are we activating that? And again, I'm sorry, I'm moving to beyond.

CAEN: You're good, go ahead.

ANTONIO: Because we're supposed to focusing on the data. But it is that question of like, who are you partnering with, and what kinds of diversity are they helping you to enable. And the volunteers as well, how diverse is the volunteer pool.

ALAN: Yeah, maybe in the future we could just look at evolution of artistic decision making models in orchestras. The plurality of perspectives that allows orchestras to speak to diverse populations. Thank you.

CAEN: Thank you, Alan. Final question.

SPEAKER: Thank you.

CAEN: For this — I should say for this part.

CARRIE: And Alan, your point is really well made, because we do see an uneven distribution of power in every regard in this report. You know, when we compare the board figures to the nonprofit sector, our board diversity is way down compared to the nonprofit sector, which in itself is seen as being unrepresentative of the US population. Equally when we look at staff compared to top executives, conductors compared to music directors, in every regard the power is unequally distributed. Henry, thank you.

CAEN: And for everyone not getting their question in right now, please hold it, and we'll have another question session, and we'll try to get to everybody. We really appreciate the thoughts.

HENRY: My question's a little more technical about the census data for multiracial and Hispanic populations. My understanding is that the census questions on that have changed during this period to add being able to choose more than one race, multi — two or more races or some other race as options.

And between those options, which I don't see in the report, that takes a large portion of the Hispanic population, and the multiracial population and its various iterations is growing the fastest of any. And I wonder how you address that, and what the plan is for future research, because that seems like an essential part of understanding what's going on.

[0:26:33.8]

EVAN: Yeah, it's a great question. And we recognize the census data is still evolving, it's imperfect also. In 2020, there was that major change to allow for multiracial category in response of answering for more than one racial or ethnic group. The American Community Survey data that we use in this report, all of the counts — all of the proportions equal 100%.

So if someone identifies as multiracial, they're not also included for, say, in the Hispanic, Latino account. But it is interesting, and I mean, I'll note that the census data, again, is imperfect. For instance, Middle Eastern identifying people, there's no category in the census for Middle Eastern identifying people. So there's still work to be done here.

ANTONIO: And Middle Eastern identifying people are typically counted as white in the census data. And if the census folks go to your home and you're not there, you're counted as white. So the census data, it's a product of human cognition and it's imperfect as well. So you know, also white — the census data does not report on the LGBTQ+ population, non-binary. So the census data kind of isn't always going to be a reliable benchmark. So I think that's actually one place that we can lead, and in self-reporting iterations of a survey we might be able to capture some of that data more accurately actually than maybe even the census.

[0:28:07.1]

CAEN: And of course the census guidelines are potentially changing as those are being reviewed at the federal level, and so you know, Middle Eastern as a category may appear in the near future, which will, again, change the nature of the results. Okay, thank you. We will pause just long enough to bring up the rest of our panel. Any questions that we did not get to in this portion, please do hang on to them. They might get answered, and if not, we'll try to come back to them.

I've seen a few hands raised, and I will try to remember them from the front end of the next question session. So I'd like to welcome up the rest of our panelists now. And sorry, let's give a round of applause for our co-authors.

[APPLAUSE]

[0:29:56.2]

CAEN: All right, thank you all for being here. This part, what we're seeking to do now, to be clear, the panel that we've added now, we are no longer speaking with the authors of the report. So in this case, what we're seeking to do is contextualize, interpret, personalize, and just kind of discuss what this data means in the field, and through all of our experiences. So that will be the focus of a lot of our discussion here at the panel. And then of course any questions or thoughts you want to share are welcome.

We do still have the authors in the room, they have not left, so questions for them can still be addressed. But now we're shifting a little bit more from the technical aspect to the experiential meaning of all of this data. And I do — I just want to pause for a moment, I want to take a cue from a session we had yesterday, where it's important for us to recognize that we're talking about numbers and census categories and all of these things.

But of course this is a lot to process because these are actual life experiences happening right now. And you know, there are signs of progress, and so those are things to be proud of. But of course as we've noted, the underlying theme is that significant underrepresentation persists. And that doesn't mean just the numbers are low, that means that people's experiences are not what they should be.

And so, you know, for anybody that is feeling that personally, or knows people that feel that personally, we just want to acknowledge that this is a deep, important, and challenging topic. And you know, the fact that we're here together is good. And is a way for me at least to feel buoyed in this. Because sometimes it does feel heavy. So if you're feeling that way, I'm with you, and thank you for being here.

[0:31:56.3]

So now, I'd like to welcome our panel. Excuse me. I'm just getting my — we have five really, really great people who represent very different parts of our field. And that's one of the aspects of this report, is that we are trying to get at going beyond just a few categories, right? Experiences are very different whether you are an orchestra musician, whether you're a conductor, a staff member, a board member. These are all different experiences, and we have different roles to play.

So with our panel here, we have, and we're not sitting in the same order of the slide, but that's okay. We've got at the far end — I'll work with the people actually in front of us. At the far end we've got Sara Vicinaiz, director of student experience at Youth Orchestras of San Antonio. Next to her we have Dr. Mieko Hatano, executive director of the Oakland Symphony. Then we have Dr. Mark Peacock, Nashville Symphony board of directors.

Then we have Fernanda Lastra, who is the conductor diversity fellow for the Buffalo Philharmonic Orchestra. And last but not least — a flutist is never least, I'll just throw that in there as a fellow flutist and fellow — we've got the illustrious Adam W. Sadberry, who is a flutist, educator, and storyteller. Let's please welcome them.

[APPLAUSE]

CAEN: So we just want to start with a brief chance for each person to kind of just share a minute or two of their own just overall response to this data. What this is saying about our field, what this is saying about your experience. We are not asking you to speak as experts. We are asking you to speak as individuals, and we really appreciate your willingness to be up here, and just be open with everybody. Is it okay if we start at the far end with Sara? And yeah, just a chance to hear your own reaction, or even how does this data interact with your life? Does this match the experience you see? Do you see something different? There's data and then there's our individual perception. So Sara, please.

SARA VICINAIZ: I would say that this report does reflect some of my experience with professional orchestras in my region in San Antonio, Texas. We are a youth orchestra in San Antonio, standalone nonprofit youth orchestra, and our youth orchestra is a little bit more representative of our city, which is very optimistic to me. I love working with youth and education.

[0:34:42.7]

520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036
americanorchestras.org

In our city of San Antonio, the Hispanic population is about 65%. In our youth orchestra, our Hispanic population is about 35%, which is an overrepresentation compared to the US census and the orchestra data reported in this report. So I find that very optimistic. I do live in a majority minority city of San Antonio, but just like my colleague in D.C. mentioned, the youth orchestras can be a good pipeline for our professional orchestras. And not only is that for future musicians and future educators, but future board members and audiences. And so the report findings do reflect my experience, but our youth orchestra is a little bit more diverse, and I'm really excited to see more youth orchestra data in future reporting.

CAEN: Thank you Sara. Mieko?

MIEKO HATANO: Hi everyone. Thank you so much for being here. This data was particularly interesting to me as someone who identifies as multiracial, which was not necessarily always seen. Of course I also use she/her pronouns, and so I am represented in that place. But as it was also mentioned, the LGBTQ community is not represented, and that is a particularly marginalized group as well still in our country today, and that is a group that I do also identify with.

[0:36:14.2]

Oakland, California is an extremely diverse place. There are over 125 language dialects spoken in that city. So our representation is really vast, and yet our orchestra is actually still extremely white, over 90% actually. And so that's one of those things that we are extremely conscious of. We are also an orchestra who has had two Black music directors in its history. Calvin Simmons in the 1980's, and then Michael Morgan for the last 30 years. And unfortunately, his passing in August of 2021 led to the attrition that you saw up above in that data.

It's particularly heartbreaking when, if one person leaves their orchestra or something, or the industry, passes or retires, those kinds of things, that that actually moves by percentage points. You know, I think that's another really big thing, that these percentages often represent one or two people as part of this. And so I think that's an area that we have to be really conscious of. And these gains are extremely important, and they should be just the signal that we are on the right track, and yet we really need to be very realistic about what it truly means in our industry.

And I really appreciate the League collating all of this data. It's not perfect, we are still missing people as I said. We are not seeing everyone. And of course the regionalization of all of this data. But you know, in this situation, the League is notifying us. And if it's not perfect data, yes, we still see a lot in

this. And as an orchestra leader, I have to take it back to my orchestra and effect change. And that's where all of this is.

[0:38:10.5]

This is not about what is the League going to do, but more so what are each of us going to do when we go back to our orchestras. And I think taking on that responsibility is something that's really key, and you know, as allies of these different marginalized groups, as cisgender white men and women, what can you do in your orchestra community to support those that identify differently to feel comfortable coming to work every day.

To come and sit in the orchestra, and they might be the only one, that one percent, and they might move that needle to two or three percent by being there. And really supporting them and their experience and their cultural background around how they fit in and how they find their own belonging in these spaces.

CAEN: Thank you, Mieko. Mark?

MARK PEACOCK: So I got asked I think to be on this panel because of the progress we made with the Nashville Symphony board of directors. So I'm speaking specifically for a board of directors, which is an area where I feel we have the absolute most flexibility in this change. My process here started at Baltimore conference 2016. So if there's anyone here from Baltimore, that was inspirational to me, basically my road to Damascus, that these changes are essential.

But more importantly, these changes can be done. And we need to be very intentional and also very unapologetic when we're making these changes. I would say these data are consistent with my experience. I really wish we could have had the slide for Black or African American involvement in our organization. It seems like 2018 was an inflection point for boards, and that maybe we've gotten better and more intentional, whereas the line for musicians is absolutely flat.

[0:40:06.6]

So I would stress that with boards we have turnover, we have flexibility, we can add extra people. To me there's really not much of an excuse for us not to have much better representation on boards.

CAEN: Thank you, Mark. Fernanda.

FERNANDA LASTRA: Yes, hello everyone. Thank you for being here. I am a woman conductor, and a Latina. I cross many categories. And I moved to the States seven years ago. So my experience is about these seven years, and also in comparison with my own country. I may say that Latin America is very, very behind. We don't have these kind of conversations, and I truly celebrate we are here today talking about this.

And yes, I can see the data in the report reflects my experience as a woman conductor. And even though I saw — you can go to appendix number two, there are many orchestras listed there with a lot of initiatives, and I celebrate those. And my position actually, I will talk a little bit after, is a result of a huge initiative by the BPO, but still there is a lot to do. And I think we need to do it together, and now. Because we are already late probably. Thank you.

CAEN: Thank you, Fernanda. Adam?

[0:41:42.3]

ADAM SADBERRY: This data is absolutely reflective of my own experiences, both playing in orchestras and deciding to decentralize them from my own life. I was previously the principal flutist of the Memphis Symphony Orchestra, and towards the end of my time period there, I realized that there is something missing in orchestras, which is in my experience largely the humanity that fuels the inclusion behind it.

And I decided to reshape my career around healing and holistic learning, which is why I decided to start training as an Alexander technique teacher. And why I am doing so much to ensure that others are aware of our own powers of compassion to empower each other, and to see the world in full spectrum. You know, it's important that we all are aware that as we go through this work, that it is extremely difficult as we all are aware, to keep in mind that we're not just looking at these numbers, but we're looking at the people that are behind them, and that we must honor everyone.

CAEN: Thank you, Adam. Before we go on to our first question I just want to come back to one point. Mieko, with the passing of Michael Morgan, which of course is really sad, I think that's an example where we know that contributes to those — the trends we see. I think we've actually arrived at a point where we are no longer looking at one individual making a huge difference.

That's not exactly something to celebrate, but the numbers are at least to the point where singular events are not affecting those trends lines. But they certainly are an example of how much loss we feel when we lose any amazing person like that. Because not only do we lose an amazing person in their work, but we lose one of the few recognized figureheads of Black conductors in that case. You know, there are not many that played the kind of role that he did.

[0:43:57.1]

So when we had that loss, I think the truly outsized feeling just shows how unique and unfortunately rare it is that conductors, as an example, are allowed to play that kind of a role. And yeah, as somebody who was able to perform with Michael Morgan through the Sphinx Symphony, you know, he just — he's dynamic. He was that energy. And we're getting better. We're getting more opportunity for more people like Michael Morgan to step up and lead. But yeah, that was really a significant loss, and you know, honestly it was a loss for the Oakland community.

Even the San Francisco Symphony across the Bay. I'm actually a San Franciscan, so I can say if the San Francisco Symphony is going to launch an award named after Michael Morgan, who was from Oakland, that is significant. Because cross Bay alliances like that do not always happen. So he was a special person. And as we're interacting with all this data, we have some experts here who will be able to keep us aware of all of these nuances.

So questions for our group here. As we're looking at the data, and we do see some progress, what can we learn from the progress we do see, and in other ways what can we see as possibilities for the areas we're not seeing progress? Perhaps there's something we can learn from the areas of progress and bring those to the other areas. We're a little bit freeform now, so is there anybody who wants to start and jump in right away on this? Or we can just go in reverse order. Whatever we feel like. Let's go with Adam. How about that? Is that going to work?

ADAM: Sure, absolutely. So one of the clearest things to me is that as a society we often move when we feel the most motivated. And in 2020, we all felt a push to acknowledge the fact that there is a great disparity in the acknowledgement of the humanity in Black people in particular, of course also with the AAPI community, and queer people, and many other communities. And as a result, we've seen the study grow so much. We've seen so much growth within orchestras in terms of diversifying repertoire and actively hiring more Black and brown musicians.

[0:46:25.9]

And at the same time, it's clear to me that the progress slows as soon as people feel as if they have an opportunity to do so. I feel like we're all more afraid of being shamed for not making progress than motivated and excited to actively create a different and more holistic society. And I think one of the things that we can do to ensure that we see the wholeness within each other, and to make this progress happen is to really focus on ensuring that when we're involving ourselves in the hiring process that we are not just looking at the quality of the musicianship, but the qualities of the humans.

I think it's important to consider, you know, do we maybe consider having interviews, do we consider having more appointments. The Memphis Symphony is doing a pretty amazing job with diversity for a lot of reasons, but in particular because they've been able to appoint a lot of their current players because they've been in a hiring freeze. So that's a unique situation. But out of the current 50 members of the orchestra, there are — there were four Black members, which included me as the principal flutist, the associate principal violist, second bassoonist, other people.

[0:47:48.2]

There were three fellows. We had a Black and Latinx assistant conductor named Karina Bevel [?] who just won a Sphinx Medal of Excellence Award, which is amazing. And all of us were very happy to be a part of the orchestra. Some felt more acknowledged than others. And it's intrinsic to the process that the ones that have decided to stick around have realized that they felt validated in their positions, and those of us who have decided to find new positions are the ones who felt as if there is more to discover and more to connect with.

So we can use this data to see that. You know, there is movement within these systems and that change is happening. And we can focus our attention on finding ways to get more people not just interested in joining the orchestras, but to stay in them.

CAEN: Thank you, Adam. To be clear also, we don't all have to answer every question, but you certainly can. So feel free to jump in as you like. Fernanda, go ahead.

FERNANDA: Yes, I want to say a couple of considerations. First of all, what is progress, and progress does not mean the same thing for every one of us. Representation doesn't mean inclusion. We need to create a culture first. And to create a good environment. And it's necessary also to be aware of the intersectionality in this data, because we can see progress, but at the same time we need to know — there are groups of people that cross many categories.

So just one more step further in the reading of the report. And also, we should think about how does it feel to have DEI in our organizations. What is the ideal. And I think progress as well, this is the positive side maybe, is always — have always backwards. It's two steps forwards, three backwards, two — but that's why we need to keep pushing. Because if we see decrease, for instance, in many categories in the report. But it's part of — because we are doing something.

[0:50:24.9]

So we are moving. That's why I think it is important to keep the good track, keep the good work, and keep moving. And also with education. It happened to me, this is just a personal experience, in a college orchestra setting, programming women composers, and the represented groups, and having students asking me. But even though I made a speech at the beginning of the semester saying, "This is important because blah blah blah," and then one day one student said — was like, "I don't know why we are playing this. Why we are not playing someone — some composer we know or something we have already done before, like some composer from the canon." And I see of course the value of our canon, but also the value of including new voices. And part of the progress is teaching, is teaching the new generations that this work is really important. Thank you.

CAEN: Thank you, Fernanda. Do you want in on this question, or move on? Your choice. Okay, all right. Next question. These — to remind everyone of the recommendations, the recommendations that are in the report. These three come to the fore. Address low representation in the following areas. Progress women's representation in top executive roles. And accelerate recent progress towards improved BIPOC representation on orchestra staff.

[0:52:01.4]

So how about for the remaining three here, any actions that you've seen across the field that you think may be addressing any of these? Things that we should be looking towards as either just great examples or perhaps even rising to best practices.

SARA: I want to go back to my comment about diversifying the pipeline. I've seen a lot of progress and I have a great recommendation for orchestras that are interested in national pathway programs. And the things that programs like youth orchestras, professional orchestras that have a youth orchestra, conservatories, and organizations like Equity Arc, that are really working on diversifying the pipeline.

We have a national pathways program in San Antonio. The YOSA Rising Star Fellows under our youth orchestra. And we have 16 fellows in our program right now, and we — they are not only interested in majoring in music performance, but becoming music educators, arts administrators, future orchestra supporters. And so I am really excited about that field and where that's going.

So I see national pathways in youth orchestras as definitely part of continuing diversifying American classical orchestras in this field. And if you have questions about national pathway programs you can ask me or Equity Arc.

CAEN: Thank you, Sara.

MIEKO: I just want to kind of tag on to what you just said. Oakland Symphony, we also have a youth orchestra as well. We're also in over two dozen schools in Oakland Unified School Districts, particularly Title I schools that are traditionally marginalized, especially in what we call Deep East Oakland as well as West Oakland. Traditionally Black and very heavy brown communities there. Heavy immigrant populations as well.

[0:54:11.9]

Actually I visited one school, and literally their library was a closet and a laundry basket. You know, so it's those kinds of schools that we actually currently have in the United States today, and bringing music there, that is the major opportunity to get them out of their cycle of poverty and trauma, and having an opportunity from K-12, and a progressive line through youth orchestras, because I mentioned we also have a youth orchestra, and having those groups that they can graduate into.

But I think also, you know, and this is the national pathways aspect of this, is what are we helping them to do and supporting them after they graduate high school. We then have a professional orchestra, but that's a really big jump. How are we welcoming them into the concert hall actually as youth, and that's another program that we have in Oakland, we call it Hall Pass. And every Title I school, not just the students, but their family members as well as teachers, the administrators at the school, and para-educators like the cafeteria staff, janitorial staff, people like that. Because they're the ones that also live in those depressed communities as well.

And we want to bring them in and ensure that they feel comfortable. You know, this isn't charity. This is their orchestra just as much as it's our top donors' orchestra. And I think that's the way that we need to be thinking about ourselves. And if they're not in our concert hall, then we're not serving our community. And we're not clearly relevant to the community as well.

And so even if they're not going to off to a conservatory, which you know, I also hope that when we send off some of our kids into conservatories, and university settings, that they're supported even though they may not have as many people that look like them or come from backgrounds that they do, that there is this support network when we send them off, that we can trust our colleagues across the country, that when we send our kids, you know, who will be lovingly brought up to love music and love this art form and love orchestras, that they're able to continue loving it, and not, you know, have this health crisis because they feel marginalized in this space that they had originally felt very safe.

[0:56:28.8]

And so how are we then stewarding them through this pipeline through their early – their school years, their early professional years, their semi-professional years, and then their professional years as audience members and as professional orchestra musicians.

CAEN: Thank you, Mieko. Anyone else want in on this question before I go on? Okay, go ahead, Fernanda.

FERNANDA: Yeah. No, I want to briefly mention about women conductors, a program from the Dallas Institute for women conductors. Right now it's the only one for women conductors I know. And besides the Kentucky Concordia [?]. And I cannot tell that the – they are up to mentor and to promote and advocate for women conductors, but I cannot see colleagues of mine now working at the large budget orchestras yet.

Yes, in the small budget orchestras. And as Latina in – on the other category, my actual position was created by the diversity council at the Buffalo Philharmonic. A council that was created in 2016. So they have been working even before the pandemic, and the events of George Floyd. And so it is a response to give to underrepresented groups, the opportunity to be, well, in my case in the role of the assistant conductor. But I understand as well that now New Jersey Symphony created a fellowship for conductors as well for underrepresented groups. So these are the three cases in my field I can name right now.

[0:58:18.7]

CAEN: Thank you. Moving on to another question. I think one of the things about this data that can be challenging for us, that can even feel dissonant for us, is that we see lots of activity happening across

the field. You know, we're all probably part of a lot of these actions that are happening, and yet the report and the data and even a lot of our experiences is telling us that that's not resulting in a lot of change yet. Not significant change, not rapid enough change.

So any thoughts here around what is missing? How can we — is it internal alignment, is it more people feeling ownership of this, is it accountability? Any thoughts you want to share about how we might move from activity to actual change? Who wants in first? Yeah, Mark, please.

MARK: So at least from a board perspective, I think it's time to be comfortable with the difficult conversations. And you say, well, we're going to get new board members and hopefully some will have a change in our composition for the board. And that's the wrong way to go. I think we need an actual intentionality, and the goals need to be set, and you need to seek out the right people, and you need to have conversations that people that are saying like, why are you asking me to join the board because my skin color's different?

[0:59:42.7]

You know, and you have to be prepared to have the conversation like, I'm asking you to join the board to help me solve a problem. I think we all should look at our numbers and percentages of our board composition compared to our own communities, and set goals, hard goals. And then you don't stop until you achieve those goals. In Baltimore there's a phrase that I thought was amazing, that finding the right person to change the composition of your board is like looking for your car keys. You know they're essential and you don't stop until you find them. So I think we really need to have very clear goals and very honest conversations about why we need to have new people on our board.

SPEAKER: Yeah, and just to expand on what you're saying. I mean, a lot of the work that's involved has to be radical. And that's not to say it has to be, quote unquote, disobedience. That's not what radicalism — what that is at all. It's really taking ownership and being courageous of something that needs to be taken care of over an extended period of time. And for a lot of us, including myself and my own work, making radical change means taking a lot of time to myself to reflect, and to for me personally journal endlessly to come back to concepts that trouble and frustrate me, and to bring those things into conversation with friends and family, and into my work space to ensure that I'm not trying to handle all of this on my own.

I think we're all intimidated by the concept of doing this because we don't necessarily think that other people struggle as much as we do with this. But it's hard for everybody. And it's important to remember that racism and sexism and all of the isms were learned. And we have to unlearn them in order to make the true progress that is coming at this moment.

520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036
americanorchestras.org

CAEN: All right. I know there's questions out there. So whether they're questions that you didn't get to before, or questions that have arisen now, let's switch gears for a moment and we'll work the room.

SPEAKER: Thank you so much. Looking back to the study authors, the question that I was going to ask was, do you have the resources to be able in the next data collection set to run simultaneously an orchestra reported set of data and a self-reported set of data to do a comparison and to be able to find out whether or not there is a discrepancy between the two and validate one against the other?

[1:02:31.1]

CARRIE: Excuse me. I think our approach currently is to provide the resources to our members that will help people to collect their own self-reported data. That's the strategy that we're looking for going forward. You know, we recognize that members want to collect self-reported data, and we want to be — do our bit to provide the templates, the resources, and the tools, and the motivation to collect their own self-reported data. That's the way we can effect this change in resource appropriate way, and within capacity.

So that's a long way around in saying, no, unfortunately we don't have the capacity to run the two methodologies simultaneously in order to compare the difference. I think our strategy has to be in a pragmatic way to shift towards self-reporting by supporting our members to do that work themselves. Yes, of course, thank you.

SPEAKER: If I can make a suggestion as a follow up. There are a number of funders who are actually very interested in this subject area. And I think that it might be possible for the League to secure at least a one time grant from such a funder to be able to run those two studies concurrently side by side to be able to do that assessment.

CAEN: We're happy to speak with them.

CARRIE: That is exciting.

CAEN: And you are welcome to contact any of us. I'm here right after this session.

CARRIE: We'll be in touch with you. Thank you.

CAEN: Yeah, back of the room.

CARRIE: Thank you. I'm blown away by the excitement of that comment. I forgot to look around the room.

[1:04:04.8]

CAROLINE SHAW: Thanks Carrie. My name is Caroline Shaw, I am the executive director for the Portland Symphony. I'm really interested in this topic of the pipeline and how we can help to support our local organizations that are also actively doing this work. And so I'm wondering if anyone on the panel or Caen, if you are aware of any organizations that are really effectively – you mentioned partnerships with universities, or potentially higher ed.

And I'm very interested in how we as organizations could potentially partner with our local institutions to help support this work, whether that is orchestral fellowships, or administratively potentially trustee leadership. So does anybody on the panel, or maybe Caen, if not, is anybody working with local organizations, universities to help to feed a pipeline through an EDI lens?

CAEN: Go ahead, yeah, please.

MIEKO: I'm actually kind of at the very beginning of this stage. Because when you go around your community and you start having conversations and you talk to people about like, what's your problem, we all pretty much have the same problems. And higher education is actually – you know, we think we have problems. Higher education is a whole nother level. But we have a junior college in our area. We have the San Francisco Conservatory just across the Bay, and we didn't traditionally use to go across very much, but actually in the last few years we partner with San Francisco Symphony even though our education programs.

San Francisco Symphony actually very generously gives us a grant every year to serve our Oakland kids, because they see themselves as more than just San Francisco. Their responsibility is to the region as a tier one organization in the region. So you know, if you're at a tier one orchestra, I think you will also need to think about how are you also resourcing these smaller orchestras who are ultimately in their own communities building the pipeline that we hope can make it all the way up to the top, right?

[1:06:04.0]

And so I think those are the kinds of partnerships that we should be looking at. And everyone's trying to diversify and reflect their community. Our junior college, they just actually got a big funding grant to be able to offer free classes, and they're trying to expand their music technology programs, and things like that. And so when we look at the education programs that we have starting in like kindergarten, you know, supporting your school district, where are they going? They're not all going to go to four year colleges, but it doesn't mean that they're not going to be successful part of the workforce.

And so how are we supporting into there. What are the resources that they have. We also have a school for the arts. And I've actually also talked with IATSE and AFM as well. And until you have these conversations you don't actually know what the resources are. AITSE, for example, has a pre-apprentice program that you can start in high school. So what are they doing? At the junior college level they have the apprentice program with IATSE actually.

With AFM, I recently found out that they have funding to help support things like, you know, if we wanted to bring kids that — from our Muse program, and youth orchestra back to the area, and have an alumni program, they would actually sponsor something like that. Because ultimately, that works for them too. How can we help incentivize our diverse musicians coming to a community, having the union possibly offer dues free for a year.

I mean, there's so many opportunities if we just talk with one another, and talk with our partners. And so you know, that's the kind of work that we're seeking to do. Looking at what is our pipeline if not workforce development and resilience of all things. You know, when you're an adult and you go to a concert, that makes you more resilient, that helps your mental health. If you're playing in an orchestra, if you're playing in a community orchestra, if you sing in our chorus, our youth orchestra, there is a support system, there's a system of belonging, and it does so many things.

[1:08:13.9]

There's tons of books out there about why music growing up, you know, and continuing in adulthood is really fundamentally important to your success in life. And success is not just measured by, you know, how much money you make or what your status is in life, it's your mental health too. And I think in 2020 we all really found all of that.

So I just recommend talking with all of the different organizations, education wise, and other, your local union even, you know? And actually that's a really great way to build relationships and bridges that are not contentious because it's not about the financials. I mean, we negotiate every few years with our union, of course. But in between those things, how are we building relationships and solving their problems, and having them help us solve our problems.

CAEN: Thank you, Mieko. Sara, do you want to talk about Equity Arc at all and National Pathways?

SARA: Yes, so Equity Arc is definitely helping make the connection between national pathway programs, summer music programs, conservatories, colleges, and professional orchestras, and they're an advocacy organization that helps national pathway programs but also BIPOC musicians come together to make those connections. And I highly suggest you look into that. If you're interested in creating a national pathways program, making those connections with other organizations, it's been an incredibly helpful community, and I think we're just getting started on that.

CAEN: Thank you.

SPEAKER: I've got the microphone again for the next question. Just very, very simply, back when you showed the recommendation slide, how did you come up with those recommendations? What were the criteria? Were the worst issues from the data, or were they ones that were the most likely to make progress over a particular period of time? I mean, what was the criteria?

CAEN: Thank you, question. Hold on.

CARRIE: Would you like it Antonio? Or would you like me to?

[1:10:21.7]

ANTONIO: Essentially we prioritized it based on the data, like what the data told us. And these were the areas that we felt like orchestras could start making the most progress in terms of the data. Like we — I can't stress enough that there's a story that the data was pointing us towards, and these recommendations are based on that evidence.

[OFF-MIC QUESTION]

ANTONIO: Absolutely.

[OFF-MIC QUESTION]

ANTONIO: Yeah, I mean, so we don't want to be prescriptive, because I think orchestras have to be bold and creative about how they help the overall field move in addressing these concerns. And so that's why we have the promise and practices and the case studies there, to point people in the direction. And it really is about where do you feel best prepared to start the journey, right?

Because each orchestra has its own journey in this work. When I'm working with my clients, I want to make sure that it's localized to their community and contextualized there, because you now, trying to do something in Tallahassee, in Ann Arbor, or in some part of Montana, it might not be the same because the populations are different. And to Mieko's point about higher ed, there's a study that came out in December that said if higher ed continues to move at the current rate that it's moving in terms of faculty diversity, right? We will never reach racial parity.

[1:12:36.0]

So faculty actually at universities have to like increase and accelerate their efforts three and a half times as much as they're doing right now to get to racial parity by 2050. And so that's a question that I think we should grapple with. We didn't answer that question in our research, right? But that is a good research question. How much would we have to accelerate our efforts in the orchestral field to reach racial parity by 2050?

CAEN: Thank you. Last question. Back right corner of the room.

[OFF-MIC QUESTION]

SPEAKER: Recommendations or action items that orchestras are taking to increase diversity particularly among our musicians. And I know that blind auditions are kind of an impediment to that. I've spoken to my orchestra committee, and they are pretty much opposed to taking the screen down. We share a lot of musicians with Oakland Symphony, and Berkley and San Jose, and maybe there's some way that we can work together to effect change in that area. But are there specific things that we can do to get more diversity on stage?

[1:13:50.0]

CAEN: Yeah, thank you. I'll take this question, and then we'll wrap up with a question for the rest of the panel. So a couple of things that already exist that we are investing in right now. For one, there's the National Alliance for Audition Support, and the recommendations about audition and tenure policies. That's available on our website. You can also — there's a link actually that takes you to the Sphinx website where that is currently posted.

Those recommendations are a good starting point. There's of course the Sphinx Orchestral Partners audition. There's our own work that we're launching with Inclusive Stages. So there's going to be some requirements to be part of that coalition because we're investing so much of our resources in it, but every orchestra will have the opportunity to be part of that, and you'll be getting communications about that this summer.

And that is very specifically to address the racial diversity of musicians on stage. And that's a coalition that's going to include administrators, musicians, union representatives, board members. So that's us trying to gather people to change the exact situation you're describing, that you're experiencing. So those are a few options that are out there right now.

The possibility also exists that you may be doing some of those things already, and you feel like, well what else can we do because it's not working. And I'll start by saying that's how a lot of people are feeling. If that happens to be you. And for us in terms of what the League can do, that is why Inclusive Stages is happening.

Inclusive Stages is our response to this data. And you know, there's — we're going to have town halls, virtual town halls. There's going to be information on the website. I could — we could do a whole nother hour just about that. But that is going to be our big investment in trying to support you in doing the work you're trying to do. Thank you for the question.

Okay, so time is slipping from us. I want to wrap up with one final question for our panel. As we all return back to our normal lives, or our work lives, you know, we hopefully are looking for ways to move from activity to change. We're looking for barriers to overcome. We're looking for new alliances. Changes in our own behavior. If you could each — maybe we can start with Sara and come back this way. Just talk for a minute or two about the opportunities or challenges you see yourself encountering as you return home, and try to move informed by all of this data and all of this discussion.

[1:16:23.9]

SARA: So right now, YOSA is about to go into our second year of the Catalyst Fund with the League of American Orchestras. And I think an opportunity that we see this upcoming year is really looking at the youth voice in our orchestra that may be missing previously. And creating a space for the youth in our orchestra to give their opinion and share power more about the decisions that we are making in our orchestra.

And you know, seeking their opinion on our diversity, equity, and inclusion initiatives. And perhaps even inviting them to serve as a youth on our board. And just different ideas about how to increase the youth voice, and making sure that they're not missing in our conversation. I think it's an opportunity for us, and I'm excited to see how that turns out this year for us. And making sure that our youth are — feel included and they feel that they belong in our organization is really important to YOSA.

MIEKO: I'll tag on that a little bit too, because again, going into that pipeline issue, unfortunately the pandemic really just, you know, decimated our pipeline. In 2019, our youth orchestra represented 75 different specific ethnic identities. And you know, everybody recognized it as being so incredibly diverse. When we came back, the orchestra we were able to recruit, they were much less diverse, much less.

[1:18:06.6]

It's actually now majority white. Because that's the community that was able to sustain private lessons over Zoom and have the types of resources they needed to sustain through the pandemic. And so in some ways, you know, a lot of us are having to start over a bit. And there's a gap. You know, and that two year gap is really huge for this pipeline for doing all that work no matter how well you were doing it. And so coming back we really had to lean into this.

And all the efforts we were doing, I mean, we have to quadruple it to get back to where we are ASAP. And so you know, for me obviously as the executive director I have to find all of the funding for it and everything. And you know, it's a tough economy right now. But that's the thing that as a board of directors, those of you who are board members, supporting those efforts and ensuring that those are the pieces that we do not underfund just because we might be, you know, in a space like this in this marketplace.

I was hired by a board of directors, that was a conscious decision, that was a priority decision. Michael Morgan was hired by a board of directors. So you ultimately all have the opportunity to effect change at the very, very top. So I just want to empower you all, and obviously those of you who are executive directors in the room, you know, you have the control over your staff and so much more of the data.

So just I hope that everybody leaves here really empowered because I know I am, having gone to the LGBTQ happy hour last night, and seeing it like doubled from last year. And going to the Olana meeting, and having that just, you know, exploding. These data points can be overwhelming with the work we have ahead of us, but we see it in our colleagues, and so just keep going.

[1:19:56.7]

MARK: Well, as I said earlier, don't walk away from here and just leave this as abstract national data. Go home and do your own numbers, set your own goals, pursue them aggressively. I mean, for boards, we're lucky, we have governance committees that want to support this change. For everyone else, they have different obstacles to include honestly unions who are opposed to some of these changes.

We're the fortunate ones that we can make changes very immediate. And I'd also just like to throw my two bits in. I think a lot of times you hear that this is a pipeline issue. I think this is much more a hiring issue.

FERNANDA: Yeah, from the conducting point of view, I think [UNINTEL] are always uncertainty and to —not to go back to old habits from the programming point of view. We have done this, we know it works. It brings audience to the hall. Let's repeat this. And I think we need to take a step further, and also if we do let's say a celebration of Hispanic Heritage Month, to ask, I don't know, support, financial support from the organization to put the same efforts financially, in marketing, etcetera, to make that concert a success, and a success, and create revenue.

Because we are missing that opportunity. And also as conductor, I — yesterday I attended the other EDI session, and I heard we need to train conductors for doing this work. And so I will bring another step, which is job description. Maybe sometimes as assistant conductors, we don't have the power as the music director have or guest conductors. Guest conductors in main — in top orchestras are almost half of the season.

[1:22:00.6]

And I don't — guest conductors, we go up and down all over the country, but I don't know what can we do as guest conductors. I think we can do the same work. Maybe because we are there like three days or one week in not as big work, but still we can contribute. So maybe to put that in the contract, to put that in the job description for assistant conductors. To be committed which kind of work we can do, and what the organization expects from us.

And again, as you said, goals. But also boundaries. If we don't accomplish this goal, what will happen? Something has to happen. If we don't accomplish this goal of bringing, I don't know, audience — we will invest let's say \$2,000 in these other programs. So something has to happen if we don't accomplish our goals in this work. Because this work is important. So these are my thoughts on this last question. Of course keep working. And this is — I think this is the answer. Keep moving, yeah. Thank you.

ADAM: So a lot of the greatest barriers that we face are internal ones. And as Mieko was saying, mental health is something that is very important to address in ourselves and within our institutions. And to put it in a broader picture, I think we can really think about the way that this is affecting us in the orchestra world as generational trauma.

Personally, you know, I look at my family and I can see that I've inherited the habit of being a workaholic, and to put the work ahead of prioritizing the life that we're all supposedly doing this work for, often are, but not always. And whenever we look in the orchestra world and see the amount of potential healing that's available, I think it's an amazing opportunity for all of us to learnt every opportunity, and to really breathe through these changes.

[1:24:13.6]

You know, whenever I sit at an orchestra, and I — and people make mistakes, and then there's an immediate fit of laughter from another side, I think that's a sign that there can be a little bit of change. I think the fact that we are all using the same audition repertoire now that we did 30 years ago is a sign that there could be a little bit more healing and change. The fact that there are still so few Black people involved in orchestra is a great sign that we can all still use some healing and change. So we can all take some time to consider what barriers are holding us back from being not just motivated to do this change, but what's maybe preventing us from seeing its importance. And to never stop remembering the emotions that are bringing all of us here into this room.

CAEN: All right, we are at time. Sorry for any questions we did not get to. Please share them with us at the League. Go ahead and scan with your phones, give us your feedback. I want to thank every

single person in here. This is meaningful, this is where change comes from. Please bring it back to your organizations. And let's give one final round of applause for our authors and panelists.

[APPLAUSE]

END OF TRANSCRIPT