

Climate Change: Orchestrating Sustainability

June 2, 2022

** This text is being provided in a rough draft format; it is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record **

HEATHER NOONAN: Good morning everyone. Thanks so much for being here. My name's Heather Noonan and I'm with the League of American Orchestras. And thanks so much for joining this session this morning. We're going to go ahead and get started. And I wanted to first of all just say we're so glad you chose to be here for this topic. We are recording this and we have some speakers joining us via Zoom. So, we hope that you'll be able to make use of this recording to share it with the stakeholders — other stakeholders — with your orchestra — who might not be in the room this morning. But we do have a quick update for you — which is — Michelene who was supposed to be joining us as one of these panelists has fallen ill and will not be able to join us today. We do hope that you can check out Sunnylands — the organization that she works with — their values around sustainability are available on their website and it's a terrific resource to explore. In the meantime, we have two other speakers from the UK who are pictured on our screen here and so we did have plans to have at least three people in the room today. And I wish I could say that this was purely due to reducing our carbon footprint that we went all electronic. But it just worked out nicely that way. And I want to thank Akilah for being our moderator as both someone who's helping to put all these pieces together, but also with some rich experience in the topic that we're discussing today. So I'm here mostly to advance slides and we will be inviting questions from the room later. So as you have them, please feel welcome to step up the mic after the presentations are done and then we'll have a conversation from there. And I'll hand it over to Akilah.

AKILAH MORGAN: Good morning everyone. My name is Akilah Morgan. I'm the director of programs for the Inner City Youth Orchestra of Los Angeles and I also serve on the board of the the 520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036 americanorchestras.org

Association of California Symphony Orchestras. So today I'm here in my capacity of Director of Programs for ICYOLA, but I also have a tiny bit of experience in the climate change field because I did work for nonprofit briefly last year and attended the COP26 Conference in Scotland.

So I want to also give our speakers on Zoom the opportunity to introduce themselves. So I'll turn it over to you, Mark.

NOONAN: Mark, we don't have audio on you. We're going to check it out from our end, Mark. Hold on one moment.

[OFF MIC CONVERSATION]

MARK PEMBERTON: Hello everybody! I'm Mark Pemberton, Chief Executive of the Association of British Orchestras. You can see me. I can't see you. But just to say, sorry I can't be with you in person. The plan originally was that I would be with you. But circumstances have kept me here in the UK. But I'm delighted to join you through the wonders of Zoom — which, thankfully is now all working.

MORGAN: Thank you, Mark. Can we hear from you Chiara?

Yeah, absolutely. Hi everyone. It's great to be in the room with you. Again, like Mark said, sadly we can't see all your faces. But it's nice to know that you're there.

CHIARA BADIALI: My name is Chiara. I am Music Lead at Julie's Bicycle. We're a non profit founded by the UK music industry in 2007. Now powering climate action across the international creative and cultural community. And I've worked there for 10 years this year — so have been really immersed in this intersection between art and climate for a very long time.

MORGAN: Perfect. Thank you both. So, we're going to just go ahead and jump right in — answering the question: What is sustainability? So, sustainability and sustainable development as defined by the UN Brundtland Commission as meeting the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. So in other words, we're thinking about and considering resources necessary for future generations and how we can preserve and equitably maintain them for future use. Next slide, please.

So, we want to answer the question: How do we live today so that future generations can thrive? So when we think about sustainability, we're thinking about some of our renewable resources like the food we eat, the trees that we cut down for buildings that we use to house ourselves and work and everything like that. We want to look at three different concepts. So, the replacement rate, equilibrium and consumption. So, replacement rate. We have to be able to replenish resources at the same rate that we actually use them. We have to replant the trees that we cut down and fish and other animals that we use for food can also repopulate. We have to ensure that those resources are being used or consumed at rates where they're actually able to replenish. Sustainability of resources means working towards equilibrium. That balance allows for the stability of our resources. And our consumption. So one of the issues that we're seeing now is that our resources are being consumed at rates that are too high for regeneration — leading to excessive consumption. We have to understand the impacts of our actions and how that does affect future generations.

Next slide. So the three E are three pillars of sustainability that work together. We can't conserve without understanding how each pillar balances with the other. So the first pillar: Environment — talks about sustaining activities that protect the environment. We have to consider if our activities are harming or helping other people and the planet.

Economy — the achieve true sustainability and for our society to be economically feasible, we have to insure that we are providing enough resources and money for people to support their actual needs.

And Equity — which is sometimes referred to as social equity. People and communities have to be treated equitably. We have to think outside of ourselves and understand how our actual consumption affects other people around the world. So avoiding things like environmental exploitation. So one of the things I think about — my family's from the Caribbean — and — a small country, a very small country. And what we've found is that a lot of the times, you know, countries that are contributing the least to greenhouse gas emissions are often affected the most by climate change.

I want to talk briefly about our artistic responses. So, as I said, last year I had the opportunity to go to the COP26 Conference in Scotland and I was able to — there were two zones — the blue zone for diplomatic countries and different parties and the green zone where people from different countries were able to actually come out and protest — talk about environmental action and what their organizations are doing. So, the focus of the conference was to bring countries and organizations together to talk about accelerating the goals of the Paris Agreement — which was a global framework to avoid dangerous climate change by limiting global warming to below two degrees Celsius with the goal of keeping it below 1.5. So, some of the things I got to see in the blue zone were

these organizations like the Royal Scottish National Orchestra, Musicians in Exile and other organizations like Music Declare Emergency who were calling for immediate action from governments throughout the world.

So we're starting to see different artists, composers and music groups all over the world creating and showcasing new music in response to the climate crisis. And I briefly want to give Scott Faulkner the stage to talk about one of them with the Reno Philharmonic.

SCOTT FAULKNER: As she said, my name is Scott Faulkner. I'm the principal bassist of the Reno Philharmonic and also the project manager of a really exciting commission called Altered Landscape that we just gave the world premiere of a couple of weeks ago in Reno. The Nevada Museum of Art has a signature collection called the Altered Landscape Photography Collection and essentially it touches on the human footprint on the Earth. And it's images of how we have walked the Earth. What we do to it — a very interesting collection. And in looking to collaborate authentically and locally, we came together on the idea of this commission. And the composer Jimmy Lopez Bellido who is a wonderful rising star or established star composer — wrote a piece which turned into his third symphony — called Altered Landscape. And this piece is informed and inspired by the photographs in the collection. But it's not really Pictures at an Exhibition — although we did play that one the second half of the concert for obvious reasons. But, it's a piece that looks — he wrote it during the depth of the pandemic and it was a really interesting process. And there's wonderful resources to find out more about this podcast and interviews you can look at — at the Reno Phil website — if you go to take a look. But this piece is a really powerful composition that's started a lot of wonderful conversations in our community around this issue. And we wanted to share it. But unlike lots of consortiums where you get orchestras so you can pay the bills, we actually had it funded. So, we decided that we wanted to give it to the world. And so we are offering this piece free to any orchestra that would like to play it — but with a pay it forward model where anyone who agrees to do it will give 520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036 americanorchestras.org

a minimum \$1,000 contribution to the Nature Conservancy — an international organization that helps to conserve our resources.

And so those gifts will pay it forward around the world. So over the next two seasons, we are hoping that orchestras from across the globe will play this amazing new work and have those conversations around that. And it just so happens that my colleague Heather Gage and I have a whole bunch of these really fancy brochures. And probably enough for everybody in the room. So, we're just going to give everybody one and we want your orchestra to join us and this is one way that we've been able to address this issue in a meaningful way. We come from a state with a lot of mining and so issues around how does that fit in? And it's important, but what do we make of it? So, this project has been really exciting and invigorating for us in that regard. So we hope that you will join us and spread the word cause it really is an exciting thing.

MORGAN: Thank you so much Scott. Alright, great. So next we're going to hear from Chiara.

BADIALI: Brilliant. Thank you for that. So, like I said, I work at a non profit founded by the UK music industry in 2007 called Julie's Bicycle and we now work across the international creative and cultural community — supporting culture to become net zero carbon and restore nature, inspire public action on climate and ecology and champion environmental justice and fairness in how they do those things. And the roots of JB really came from the idea that just pushing artists out on stage to wag their fingers at audiences couldn't be the only thing that we do. We have to think of arts and culture as an ecosystem and that means if we want to see the kind of change that we need, we have to work with everyone from freelancers to institutions to funders to create a supportive framework in which that art can really thrive and in which our relationship with our communities can really thrive as we're taking action on climate.

Next slide. And I think this comes down to the fact that we as the people who are live now actually have to solve this huge issue around climate change. The climate is not going to stop changing until we stop putting more greenhouse gases into the atmosphere. And that is a really tall order. We have pushed the life support systems of our planet to the point where much of that sort of stable climate and natural systems that our civilization and our culture has grown up in, is no longer as stable. And we can see that reflected in headlines from all over the world. No person, place, job or sector is going to remain untouched. And that means that the decisions that we make now are going to really set the course for the next millenium. And if you're living and working today, this is going to be part of your life's work. It's sort of the context in which all of our lives are taking place. We can see that as really frightening — which I think some people do. But we can also embrace it as a sort of profoundly meaningful moment in which our actions and decisions matter. And in the middle of this transformation, there are so many cultural questions. Fundamentally, this is about who gets to pollute, who benefits from that pollution and who pays for it. And how we respond to those questions is at its heart, a cultural question that speaks to our values, how we want to relate to each other and the kind of world that we want to make and sustain. And that's why the role of the arts is so important and why the arts do have to be at the heart of how we respond.

Next slide. And I think that offers us sort of a deeply rich and creative landscape for everyone working in the arts — including orchestras, artists, vendors, funders and institutions to take action. It means reducing the emissions from how we make and present creative work and trying to think about how we use less resources and actually help regenerate them. It means recognizing that the huge number of people that we reach and the many opportunities that that gives us for role modeling the kind of world we want to see when audiences and others come into our spaces and come to engage with our art.

We have an opportunity to kind of normalize some of those changes that are coming — especially in areas where we will need to see some shifts in behavior in richer countries in the global north — like what we eat and how we get around. And lastly, it can mean finding ways to use our platforms to get engaged in politics — bring people together — think about what it might mean to help our communities build resilience and adapt to the changes in temperature and climate that are already baked in — how we work through the grief that comes with that changing climate and that changing landscape. Working with others to find new ways of knowing instead of co-create new knowledge and research and all of that, of course, also includes the art itself.

Next slide. So, at Julie's Bicycle, we work to support all kinds of responses in those three areas that I just talked about — both through our creative green consultancy program which works one to one with different orchestras and venues on their strategies and understanding their carbon footprint and what they can do and how they write this into policies. We have something we call our creative climate leadership program. If there is anyone joining in from Canada — we're actually just about to open applications for an addition there. So if anyone would be interested in that, then do email me to find out more. That's sort of an intensive development in transformation program for people working in the arts who want to take a lead on climate action. And we also do a lot of work with cities and funders and to see how they can best support arts organizations to take action and sort of scale up the funding and support and resources that are available as we navigate the current context. And as part of that, one of our main programs is a ten year partnership with Arts Council England which is the main national funder of the arts in England.

And 10 years ago, they made it a condition of funding for those organizations that get regular support, to report on their environmental impacts, put in place an environmental policy and action plan and Julie's Bicycle sort of handles that program for the Arts Council and also provides a really rich program of events and support and guidance for organizations and people working in the arts

520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036
americanorchestras.org

who want to take action. So, what's on the screen at the moment is a sort of snapshot of some of the data that we collected in 2019-20. Again, trying to understand what are our emissions hotspots? What does that tell us about where we need to focus our energy? And also, what does that tell us about where we need to go and ask for investment? Either from government or potentially from philanthropic funders about taking action on these. And of course the other thing that it's done is really shifted the landscape in terms of the literacy that the whole workforce in the arts in the UK because they're having to sort of engage with this and try to think about how they translate this into their action plans.

Next slide. The other thing that we found working on this program is that it is creating a huge amount of value that is perceived by organizations. So, we run an annual survey and on a practical level, people are saying that they're finding that environmental policy useful in funding applications and also in contributing to business planning. Half of the organizations actually say that they've experienced creative or artistic benefits from engaging in that environmental action. And three and four actually say that that environmental action has helped improve team morale and well being. And I think that's really important as we consider, again, that we're all sort of trying to figure out what climate change means for us and giving people the option to bring that into their work can be really, really beneficial.

Next slide. I think because we live in this era of climate change, environmental action is a process. It's a way of working.

It's a reset of some of the stories that kind of inform our thinking every day. We're not going to arrive at this end destination where suddenly we're green. This is much more about how we thread through

recognition of our ecosystems, the life support systems we depend on — and how they interact with social justice and health communities through everything that we do.

Next slide. In terms of kind of starting points to think about, I think because culture is an ecosystem, everyone has a role to play. We can think of that in terms of our spheres of influence and for each of us, there are things we can control, things we can influence and things that feel outside our control but that we could still campaign on or raise our voices about. You know, if you're a venue, you have the opportunity to decide how that venue's powered and how much you invest in energy efficiency and what options are open to people coming through your space? You can influence how people travel and you can lobby and campaign on things like investment in public infrastructure. For example, the Royal Albert Hall here in London recently wrote an open letter to one of their local authorities to campaign for better bicycle lane provision for their artists and audiences. If you're an orchestra that doesn't control your own venue, you can make sure that you are represented on a venue's green team. If you're hosted by someone, you can work with your players to look at traveling more sustainably. You can use a green rider on tour to open those conversations. If you're a programmer or an artistic commissioner, you can think about new formats. One thing we're seeing people experiment with is touring formats where only a few principal players travel instead of opening up opportunities to foster creative collaboration with local musicians or formats where the idea or the show travels, but the players remain local. And of course if you're an individual player or artist, you can bring up climate with your union or others in your orchestra network. Next slide.

So, I think we'll get into some of that in more detail in the conversation, but for kind of practical resources, to follow up on some of that, we have a huge library of free case studies for search, podcasts and webinars on the JB website — that includes kind of top tips and starters — like the green orchestra's guide — which I think Mark will say a few more words on. But also deep dives into

more specific topics like offsets and carbon pricing or climate justice and how we translate that into our work. Thank you.

MORGAN: Thank you, Chiara. We'll now hear from Mark.

PEMEBERTON: Thanks Chiara, that's a really useful introduction. And hello everybody again. Maybe just to expand a little bit more on my roles. So, the Association of British Orchestras is in effect — it's the equivalent to the League in the UK. But the UK is a smaller country. I have 70 professional orchestras in my membership. We also have youth orchestras, national youth ensembles, concert halls, funding agencies, broadcasters. So the whole classical music, orchestral music community comes together. And I always think with people I meet at the League that the best way to describe myself is that I am Simon Wood's Mini Me. And though I want to say thank the League, actually, but the League inadvertently prompted the ABO to take an interest and prioritize climate change way back when I started in 2007 — so 15 years ago. Because back in 2008, I came to the super conference that you had in Denver where the orchestras and theaters — sorry, associations — came together. And I attended a presentation, I think it was around Denver's ambitions as a sort of cultural city. And there were all these images of cars and freeways and parking lots and how they were going to provide parking and it was all about the car. The car. The car. The automobile — as I think you could say. And at the end, I turned to people at my table and I said, "I'm just interested, is anybody here talking about climate change?"

And this man turned his beady eyes at me and he said — and forgive my terrible American accent — he said, "Son, you're just gotta understand. You ain't never going to get Americans out of their cars." So, I thought, hang on. There's something slightly wrong here because we're already thinking climate change being very clearly a topic of concern. So in 2008, I made it the primary topic of my annual

conference. And we titled that conference: Sustain. And we put climate change at the heart of the discussions that we were having. That prompted a huge interest among my membership and we created a working group formed of orchestras, concert halls and artist managers because the key to this is partnership working. Bringing stakeholders together with a single objective. And we work towards creating an agenda for climate change. And we were delighted then to work with Julie's Bicycle. And Arts Council of England gave us some funding and we worked with Orchestras Live which is a development agency for orchestras. We commissioned Julie's Bicycle and they came up with — next image on the slide: The Green Orchestra's Guide — which Chiara has already mentioned. So, we had the guide — which is a practical tool for how to be more sustainable in your practice. We then also, with them, next slide — they also did moving arts which was a toolkit for how you measure the emissions created by an orchestra. The third component of this was we created a charter where we wanted orchestras to sign up to a commitment to be greener in their practice. But I want to flag the time frame for this: 2008-2010.

Our timing was terrible because we had the global financial crash. And I remember how ugly things got in the USA. They got pretty ugly here too. There was a financial crisis that slammed into orchestras hard and everybody got distracted by surviving. And they said, "Yeah, yeah Mark. We hear your green agenda. We're just going to put that aside, at the bottom of the in tray and we'll come back to it when things are more benign." And of course it sat in that in tray for a very, very long time. And I was concerned that we were sort of neglecting this key topic. And in 2012, we had a conference session where I said, "Let's reactivate this agenda." Now, I don't know how many of you are in the room today, but I can tell you in a conference of 300, people, six turned up to that session in 2012. And that was indicative that it really was not at the top of people's priority list. But here we are, quite a few years later and in the run up to — to — Akilah mentioned Glasgow COP. In the run up to COP, I said, "We've got to. We absolutely have to get this back up there." And as you've also heard from Chiara, our primary funding agencies, the Arts Councils — were saying this is now fundamental

to our future decision making. You're not going to get any more money if you don't start to build in environmental sustainability into your planning. So there has been a renewed energy on this. And I was particularly pleased in 2021 — if we just move to the next slide — that our colleagues in Scotland dusted off the Green Orchestra's Guide — re-checked with Julie's Bicycle — who said, "It's still completely valid. It slightly has an over obsession with CD packaging, which is a little dated. But it's still bang on in terms of the practical tools that you can do to reduce your emissions."

And Scotland has — sort of — in a way, made it more relevant to today's needs and it's a really good practical guide of how to — yeah, how to get more sustainable in the way in which we operate. Because, let's face it, it isn't easy being green. There are huge challenges. But no one's saying that we're just going to become net zero over night. It's a journey around reducing one's emissions. And we're now in a situation — on to the next slide — where the funding agencies — Arts of England [?] — which is not entering its new ten year plan — is absolutely saying environmental sustainability is non negotiable. So there's a very clear statement up on the slide that's in front of you that tells how it underpins from here on in the funding that will be given to those organizations. And all the arts organizations in England have just — on the 18th of May — was the deadline — for their latest bid to get public subsidy. And all of them have been required to write environmental sustainability into that funding application. And we will know in October who has got funding and who therefor will take it forward. So, there are practical tips that we can give you through the guides that have been produced. And I'm happy to have more of a conversation in a room around what that might look like in practice. But basically, look — people — orchestras are still going to move from place to place. Audiences are still going to go to concert halls. But how do we make that greener? And it will require partnerships with your city authorities, public transit systems help. It's about getting people out of their petrol driven cars and having a better way in which they move around their city. We all have to work on this together. But it is something so fundamentally important that we're going to do our best

here in the UK and I hope that what we talk about today will help you in US also make progress on this very crucial topic. So, thanks.

MORGAN: Thank you, Mark. So, a question I have is — so, how do we actually get started? So, for organizations — smaller organizations, larger organizations — where do you actually start? How do you start on your goal towards sustainability?

PEMEBERTON: Chiara, are you going to do that? Or —?

BADIALI: I can do that and then I think if you want to speak to that as well. So, I think we always — there are a few things. One is around understanding. And that can mean — particularly for larger organizations and institutions, it does actually mean collecting some data on your impacts — calculating an initial carbon footprint so you can understand, again, where you're at today and also keep track and keep yourself accountable in terms of whether you are reducing those emissions. A second really big part is around commitment. And that really comes back down to people. I think both in terms of giving people permission to bring this into their work. So often, you know, someone might say, "But I work in the marketing department," or you know, "We work in classical music. Can I justify taking time on this?" And actually setting that out as an organizational commitment and saying, "This is something you are allowed to bring into your role." Having that openness for people to start finding solutions in their particular area of expertise just means we have so many more brains working towards it. And also, threading it throughout — so having board level champions for those of us that have boards. Having a senior level champion who, again, can represent this in conversations around budgets and fund raising. And then, yeah, having kind of staff — green teams — having stuff written into job descriptions — potentially a sustainability champion for larger organizations.

So, having that commitment and that understanding. And then the last part is sort of brining it alive. Again, that's where some of the creativity comes in. Sort of letting it take on a role of its own in terms of how we — what the big issues might be in the communities that we work in and how we link into those from an environment perspective. Again, giving people something to actually care about in terms of driving this forward.

PEMEBERTON: And I would just add that I think that the best place to start is your building and your office. Buildings are relatively — you know — it's a great place to start because if we're talking about low energy, we're talking about reducing costs. So why would you not do it? So, start with actual bricks and mortar. And once you've got that measured and worked out how to reduce emissions, then focus on the art itself. How do you get musicians to and from the building? How do you get audiences to and from the building? How do you encourage people to travel in a more sustainable way? Something else interesting — I mean, Australia's a good example because Australia is a long way away. When an artist comes to Australia, the orchestras all work together to plan that that artist will do at least — you know — five, six dates across orchestras so that there's only the one flight over. Then they travel internally and then they go back. We do an awful lot in our business of one hit wonders. We go, we leave. And it's about planning. How do we plan a tour that's sustainable? How do we plan bringing in artists in a way that's more sustainable? And just set maybe a 10, 15, 20 year target by which you know that that's where you aim to get to — that your emissions will have reduced by a percentage by that date and work towards it. Now, the key thing — as I said earlier — is brining a lot of people together in partnership and talk to the musicians. What do the musicians want?

I think you'll find many of your musicians are concerned about the environment. And would love to work with managers on a joint agenda. So often we try to make decisions on behalf of musicians [UNINTEL] they may be genuinely working in full partnership with them.

MORGAN: How do you actually convince people that this work is important? I know that we spoke briefly about people in a marketing department. How do you convince your board? How do you approach them with something like that? That this work is important to us. How does our organization help on the road to sustainability?

BADIALI: You want to go first, Mark?

PEMEBERTON: No, Chiara, I'll leave you to that one. My brains cells think.

BADIALI: I think the drivers for change — there's a few that — there can be the financial — again, particularly if it is a bldg. We're exposed to things like energy price shocks. That is happening a lot at the moment. I don't know if it's as bad in the UK as it is in England. But we're seeing venues whose energy bills are kind of tripling or quadrupling over night. Where, if we could secure the investment for more energy efficiency, that is more money back into the institutions. I think there's something about linking climate and environment directly into our values and missions. It is such a rich agenda that there are so many links that can be made in terms of linking into social justice issues. Climate change is a human rights issue. It's a health issue. It's an issue for our communities. Like you mentioned at the start, the impacts fall disproportionately on those already disadvantaged in other ways. And I'm sure if we looked through any orchestra or venue — kind of — mission and vision, if our aspiration is to do good in the world, then those are parallels that we can make. And I think sometimes framing something as experimentation can also help move people who might be sitting a little bit on the fence. For example, one of the theaters here in London — The Young Vic — a few years ago, they did a series of classics for new climate productions.

But because they isolated them as sort of these single productions, it meant pushing everyone who was involved in those to sort of take sustainability actions to the next level. But because it was for a single production, it sort of de-risked — almost — the process for people, again, who weren't so sure because it was just for the one production. And again, it helped people think a bit out of the box of what can we do here that extra? And it looked both at the production in terms of design and rehearsals, but also opened up interesting conversations about, for example, what products were stocked in the theater bar? And some of those changes were then integrated into the day to day operations. Some things that maybe worked less well were sort of learning for the future to come back to. But again, it sort of — almost framing it as a creative challenge created that interest for everyone to pitch into it.

PEMEBERTON: And in our experience over here, we tended to find that younger members of staff are the ones pushing for change. And I think that if you are — there are truly democratic organization — you're going to want to listen to all the voices of your organization. You're going to find an awful lot of people are already actually getting this and are absolutely adamant that something has to change. I think in terms of governance — I mean, governance primary role is future thinking and analyzing the risk. And this is a genuine risk. Where — if — if the scary graphs that we see around what climate change is going to mean. I mean, I know for example in California there's a terrible drought at the moment. That must inevitably be linked to climate change. So if the planet is going to keep getting warmer — more and more warmer — that drought is going to go on and on and on. And eventually, you're not going to be able to function as organizations. So, what can you do in collaboration with everybody else that's, frankly, got to do something about this? And tap into the energy of the people in your organization who want this change to happen — to do your bit.

And it's hard to see where — yes — there are going to be some people who are going — as I faced — who are going to go, "Yeah, yeah, we know that. Just not now." But now is the time to do it. You know?
520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036
americanorchestras.org

We lost 10 years for when I set out with this agenda — to people saying, “Not now.” Well, you know, and we see where we are. The planet has clearly gotten more damaged through that decade and it’s not looking good. So, I think on the whole, if you start asking around — you’re going to find a lot of willing participants in a program of positive change.

MORGAN: Thank you. My last question: How can we involve our constituencies? Our audiences and our communities?

PEMEBERTON: Same thing again, I would think. Talk to them. Ask them. What do they think? Yeah. I mean, I can’t believe there won’t be — none of your audience — who are going to say, “Yeah, we think the planet’s in danger. We’re very keen to hear what you’ve got planned to reduce your emissions.” So, you know, have that big conversation, I’d say.

BADIALI: And I think around that, some things are, like, definitely a conversation that’s really important. And even some small practical things like if you run audience surveys, asking people around specific issues. For example, food or transport — can help you build up a picture of actions that you can take. And again, it also helps build that evidence base in terms of — actually our audiences have said that they’re interested in this and they’re willing to take action — that you can, then, also use to hopefully convince people who might be a little bit more hesitant or critical.

But, you know there are also some things that you don’t have to communicate outright. Ultimate — particularly — again, if you are a venue or an event that sort of welcomes people into your space. You are making decisions about how that space is managed. For example, if you’re offering food, offering more plant based menu options or even going fully meat and fish free — which some venues and festivals here in the UK have done. It’s sort of, you are taking that step as leadership step as an

520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036
americanorchestras.org

institution and it means it's not down to the audiences to make that choices. [sic] Some things can be about making things more possible or easy — like how clear is it to get to a show by public transport? Are those instructions top of the page? Are they going out to ticket buyers? If someone was interested in arriving by bicycle, do they know where they can lock up their bike? I mean, everyone has parking instructions on their website. Do we all have bicycle parking instructions on there? And you know, some venues have also managed to negotiate deals with their public transport providers here in the UK — the Sage Gateshead event tickets include metro travel. And then, some of it is also about the sort of creativity that comes with it. I think, particularly if you are putting on a performance that is more environmentally themed, giving people that take away at the end of the night — organizing maybe a talk or something that is linked to that performance for people to explore those issues in more depth. Having that conversation, potentially as well, with your local authority or the city in which you operate and going, “What are the big issues here that you're trying to get people engaged and involved with? And how can we come on board with this?” That's an approach that's worked really well here in the UK. In Manchester where a network of arts organizations — The Manchester Arts Sustainability Team — now sits — is represented on the Manchester climate change board that makes decisions on the climate strategy for the city. And it means that culture is represented at those decision-making levels and we're really, really involved and engaged in how our cities are developing for the future and sort of encountering climate action.

MORGAN: Thank you. I want to open up the floor for questions. If anyone has questions for our panelists, please feel free to come up to the mic. Thank you.

MALE VOICE: Hello, my name's Brandon Fabor [?] LA Chamber Orchestra and I saw that in the beginning of the program, there was the part on inequity, or equity. And particularly social inequities and economic and social inequities that our orchestra field relies so heavily upon — in many ways.

And I was wondering if there was any part of that conversation that would be folded into this discussion today.

MORGAN: Chiara or Mark?

BADIALI: We've been looking at a lot of climate justice work in this context and thinking, again, how we link the environment and climate work, I guess, in really practical ways. And again, that threads through from everything in terms of, for example, collaborations and partnerships. So, encouraging bigger institutions, if they are running environmentally themed program, sort of, how do you create partnerships with more grass roots organizations and environmental campaigners in terms of sharing resources? And sort of, what would it genuinely look like as well to share more power in that context and build that trust? Some of it can come through, again, programming and creative projects. I think — these are not from classical music — but one other example is another theater company in London — worked with a group of young people to co-write a piece on air pollution with them and sort of educate them on the impacts of that.

And then, actually, they got to perform that piece to their local councilors and politicians ahead of a vote on air pollution. And I think for all of them who were involved in that project, they were young people — quite often from more disadvantaged communities in that neighborhood and they said, you know, "I never thought that I would be able to stand in front of one of my local politicians to make my case. And I've been given that opportunity to do that." So I think is amazing work that we can do in that space. Some of it can also be — you know — just linking into bigger fund raising and climate justice conversations. You know, leveraging if you do have audiences traveling and for example, a donation program that is linked into getting audiences to donate to account for their travel emissions. Donating those to a climate justice cause instead of just buying off set credits that may or

may not have the impact that they promise that they will have. So I think there are lots of ways that we can sort of thread through social and climate justice into the work that we do on climate.

PEMEBERTON: And I think that there's an enormous link between the issues around climate change and issues around social justice. I feel that for many decades now, you know, rich Western countries have exploited poorer nations across the world for their assets — their natural assets. Our hunger for oil has fueled all kinds of injustices around the world. Unfortunately, some of our move towards being green in practice equally means that we — in a country like Chile — is now facing a crisis — a water crisis — because the need for water for lithium mining — which then creates all the batteries to Teslas.

It's a problem that our hunger for energy is at the expense of peoples across the planet. And here in Europe, we've now got issues around mass migration from the African continent because that country is getting less habitable as a result of a warming planet. And that creates all kinds of issues around how migrants are treated in the rich Western European nations. So, there are uncomfortable linkages, I'd say. And if we as an art form, can take a lead here and actually say, "We're doing this on climate change because we wanted a more just world and a more just society." I think that's absolutely a non negotiable we do this.

MORGAN: Thank you. Do we have any other questions from the audience?

MALE VOICE: Hi there. Thanks for the great presentation. I'm Byron Harrison from Charcoal Blue. I wondered — orchestras aren't often the owners and operators of their buildings and I wondered if we might address the issues for tenant ensembles who might feel like their hands are tied in some of

these environmental issues and what pressure they can put on the people who own and operate those venues?

PEMEBERTON: Well, as I said, we start from the premise we've got to sit down with concert halls. Hardly any orchestra in the UK runs its own hall. So, we absolutely have to look at residence agreements and even higher agreements. Chiara talked about the green riders. It's around saying, "This is what we need, if we're coming to you as an orchestra or even if we're hiring you. This is what we want." But it's back to the whole thing I'm saying. You've just got to open up a conversation and bring together action groups that are on the same page on this. Because yeah, you're right. If the hall is refusing to do anything about it, the orchestra is in a weaker position. But there's still thing the orchestra can do itself that reduce its emissions.

One of the things I'm always uncomfortable about is if we sort of try to pass the blame and say, "Well, I can't do anything cause they're not doing it." There's always something we can do. And Chiara's nodding.

BADIALI: Yeah. I don't know that I have that much to add to that. I think it really is just following up on Mark's last point, I think really is opening up those conversations and not assuming sometimes that just because the work doesn't feel that visible, that maybe it isn't happening. Again, a lot of the time, you will hear orchestras saying, "Well, I would do this, but you know, the venue isn't doing it." And the venue's going, "Well, we're trying to do all this, but actually you know, we're so dependent on the orchestra who are our tenants, and they're not doing it." And so instead of someone actually having that conversation in the first place and going, "Oh, how do we align around this?" So, I think, yeah, having the conversation. And where there are — most venues will now have some form of green team. And again, making sure that there is representation from the orchestra on the venue and the

building green team, I think is really important, again, for opening up those channels of communication and being involved in those conversations.

MORGAN: Perfect. Thank you. Do we have any other questions? Go ahead.

FEMALE VOICE: Hi, I'm Dawn Catapan [?] from the Toronto Symphony. Thank you for the presentation. My question is that in our sector, there seems to be this expectation that major symphony orchestras are going to do big tours to Europe or big tours to Asia with many cities and many people in big programs. Or we're bringing in guest artists, you know, for very exclusive experiences to bring audiences in. And I'm wondering how we either reconcile that with the concept of sustainability or shift the narrative to one that allows for greater sustainability?

PEMEBERTON: Yeah, I'll just come in first to say, look, we had that very conversation back between — in 2009/2010. And we've always started from the premise you've got to balance the value of cultural exchange with the need to get better on climate change. So, we're still going to go on tours. How do we go on tour more responsibly? More sustainability? I think it's difficult — I mean — there is an argument we could just completely localize our practice. I've had it said to me, "Why do we play this game that a US orchestra comes to Europe and a European orchestra goes to Asia and an Asian orchestra comes to the US?" We all have great orchestras on our doorstep. But I think we get value from hearing the sounds and the experiences of orchestras from other parts of the world. So, I would hope that we can still tour. But you just look at the planning and how you — as you said — if you can get six, seven dates knitted together — that's a better start. I mean, I remember one orchestra flying over for BBC Proms — [UNINTEL] Singapore. A Singapore orchestra came to London for one gig. And went home again. That's the sort of practice that I think we now have to realize — literally not sustainable. And we just have to work out — and I talked about artists. It's around — if you bring an

artist over to the States, just being aware — where? Where else are they performing? How many gigs are they doing to make it so that in a way, you're only paying for the one trans Atlantic flight. And minimizing, then, the internal travel before they go home.

BADIALI: Absolutely. I think tackling some of those almost lower hanging fruit of no longer doing one off performances in that way — or if you are in charge of programming, getting rid of things like exclusion zones that make those more coherent tours very difficult.

I think one thing I would say is the reality of where we're at now and having sort of squandered so much time on this. Air travel is one of the most unequally distributed areas of impact around the world. You might often hear the figure of, you know, well, air travel is only responsible for like 2-3% of global carbon emissions. But that's with the majority of people not flying in a year. Only something like 4% of people of the global world population actually took an international flight in 2018. And I think there does have to be a recognition and there is a recognition in environmental and climate circles that when it comes to air travel, because we don't have greener technologies that will arrive in time for our emission reductions that we have to achieve, we will need to stop growing the overall volume of air travel. There has to be something called constrain demand. And I think opens up some difficult questions for us in the arts — especially about, again, sort of, equity in exchange. So for example, at the moment, it is a majority of global north orchestras in America or from Europe that are traveling to other places of the world. And if we see ourselves as having an overall air travel budget, what would it mean to redistribute that to actually open up more opportunities for orchestras and musicians who are based in Africa, in India, and other places in the world that haven't historically had that opportunity of international exchange in the same way — to give them the space to develop that as well. I think that is a question that we can and need to ask ourselves. Again, some localization — maybe — what does it look like? How do we start building up those opportunities in different ways? Where can we find the benefits of working more locally? And thinking about different formats. So
520 8th Avenue, Suite 2005, New York, NY 10018 1602 L Street, NW, Suite 611, Washington, DC 20036
americanorchestras.org

yeah, maybe not a whole orchestra traveling every time, but it actually being fewer players who travel. What does that look like? What kinds of models can we build up around that? I think where we're at now is such a crisis point that in some ways, all of those creative ideas have to be on the table and we have to explore them and at least, sort of get our minds to consider them.

And I think that the last thing as well — that I'll say to that is we also do a huge amount of business travel in the arts for all kinds of things — whether it's client meetings between managers and musicians and whether it's kind of — again — other exchange meetings. And that is one place where we can set ourselves targets to reduce the amount that we fly without having an impact on the art itself. And we are, again, we are seeing more and more organizations do that. For example, putting in rules that you know, any business travel that can be done by train and under six or eight hours, will be done by train and flight is not even an option to have that reimbursed on expenses.

MORGAN: Great, thank you. Mark, I know you have to head out. So we're going to close off the session today. So thank you everyone for being here. I truly appreciate that and for listening and taking this conversation back to your orchestras. Thank you.

NOONAN: And I just want to say one additional note of thanks to Akilah for moderating this and shaping the content and also in the conference app, our speakers have loaded some links to their resources. So, please do check them out so you can take a deeper dive and share them with your friends. We'll soon have the recording of this session available. And again, just — I know there are a lot of people who wanted to be in the room today or you want to share this with others in your organization. That'll be available to you soon too. Thank you.

MORGAN: Thank you everyone.